

JONATHAN SHUB (SBN 237708)  
SHELLER, LUDWIG & BADEY  
1528 Walnut Street, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102  
Tel: (215) 790-7300  
Fax: (215) 546-0942

IRA P. ROTHKEN (SBN 160029)  
ROTHKEN LAW FIRM  
1050 Northgate Drive  
Suite 520  
San Rafael, CA 94903  
Tele: (415) 924-4250  
Facsimile: (415) 924-2905

RALPH M. STONE (pro hac vice)  
SHALOV STONE & BONNER LLP  
485 Seventh Ave  
New York, NY 10018  
Tele: (212) 239-4240  
Facsimile: (212) 239-4310

STAN MALLISON (SBN 184191)  
LAW OFFICES OF MALLISON &  
MARTINEZ  
1004 Brown Ave  
Lafayette, CA 94549  
Tele: (925) 283-3842  
Facsimile: (925) 283-3426

*Co-Lead Counsel*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
**(SAN JOSE DIVISION)**

\*E-FILED - 1/25/06\*

In re: PALM TREO 600 and 650  
LITIGATION

This Document Relates To:

All Actions

**PRETRIAL ORDER NO. 1**  
**Master File No. C-05-03774-RMW**

1 **MASTER FILE NO. C-05-03774-RMW**

2 **PRETRIAL ORDER NO. 1**

3 **ORDER**

4 The parties to this consolidated proceeding have conferred and submit this stipulated case  
5 management proposal including the organization of plaintiffs' counsel. This Order shall govern  
6 the pre-trial proceedings and trial of these consolidated actions and all subsequent related  
7 actions, which are added-on, transferred or otherwise consolidated as part of this consolidated  
8 proceeding.

9 **I. CONSOLIDATION OF RELATED ACTIONS**

10 1. These actions and any actions filed in or transferred in or transferred to this  
11 District which arise from facts similar to those in the present action are hereby consolidated  
12 pursuant to Rule 42(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. This consolidation is for all  
13 pretrial proceedings and trial, and applies to all of the following cases:

- 14 a. *Gans v. PALMONE*, Civil Action No. 05-cv-03774-RMW, filed in the  
15 Northern District of California;  
16 b. *Berliner v. Palm, Inc.*, Civil Action No. 05-cv-03854-RMW, filed in the  
17 Northern District of California;  
18 c. *Geisen v. Palm, Inc., aka PALMONE, INC.*, Civil Action No. 05-cv-  
19 04120-RMW, filed in the Northern District of California; and  
20 d. *Moya v. Palm, Inc.*, Civil Action No. 05-cv-03926-RMW, filed in the  
21 Northern District of California;  
22 e. *Loew v. Palm, Inc. aka PALMONE, INC.*, Civil Action No. 05-cv-03980-  
23 RMW, filed in the Northern District of California;  
24 f. *Palza v. Palm, Inc.*, Civil Action No. 05-CV-04408-RMW, removed to the  
25 Northern District of California.

- 26 2. The clerk shall establish and maintain a Master Docket and Master File for this  
27

28 **PRETRIAL ORDER NO. 1**

**Master File No. C-05-03774-RMW**

proceeding under the caption “*In re Palm Treo 600 and 650 Litigation*,” Master File No.

C-05-03774 All orders, pleadings, motions and other documents, when filed and docketed in the Master File, will be deemed filed and docketed in each individual case.

3. Henceforth, every pleading or other such document in this consolidated proceeding, which ordinarily contains a pleading caption, shall bear the following caption:

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
(SAN JOSE DIVISION)**

In re: PALM TREO 600 and 650  
LITIGATION

MASTER FILE NO. C-05-03774-RMW

PRETRIAL ORDER NO. 1

This Document Relates To:

All Actions

4. When a pleading or other captioned document is intended to be applicable to all actions which are part of these proceedings, the words “All Actions” shall appear immediately after the words “This Document Relates To:” in the caption set forth above. When a pleading or other captioned document is intended to be applicable only to some, but not all, of such actions, the last name of the first-named plaintiff in said action and that case’s individual action number shall appear immediately after the words “This Document Relates To:” in the caption set forth above.

**II. ORGANIZATION OF PLAINTIFFS’ COUNSEL**

5. The organizational structure of plaintiffs’ counsel established by this Order shall bind plaintiffs’ counsel in the Consolidated Actions, including any action subsequently governed by this Order.

a. As Co-Lead Counsel:

- b. As members of the Executive Committee:

- c. As Co-Chairs of the Executive Committee:

7. Co-Lead Counsel. Co-Lead Counsel shall have day-to-day responsibility for the management of the consolidated litigation; shall determine how to prosecute the case and shall coordinate and supervise the efforts of plaintiffs' counsel in the consolidated action in

1 the areas of discovery, briefing, trial and settlement. Co-Lead Counsel shall also be deemed to  
2 be members of the Executive Committee.

3 8. Co-Lead Counsel shall designate responsibilities for specific tasks to plaintiffs'  
4 counsel in the consolidated cases in a manner to assure that pretrial preparation is conducted  
5 effectively, efficiently and economically; shall assist the Executive Committee and its co-chairs  
6 in maintaining communication among counsel; and shall monitor the activities of plaintiffs'  
7 counsel to assure that schedules are met and unnecessary expenditures of time and money are  
8 avoided. Co-Lead Counsel shall maintain the official service list of all plaintiffs and plaintiffs'  
9 counsel in the Consolidated Actions, including their addresses. Co-Lead Counsel shall perform  
10 whatever any additional functions that may be assigned to them by the Court. Agreements  
11 reached between defendant and Co-Lead Counsel are binding on all plaintiffs and their counsel.  
12 No discovery shall be served, and no motion shall be filed, by any plaintiff's counsel without the  
13 consent of Co-Lead Counsel, unless leave of Court is obtained.

14 9. Executive Committee. To the extent delegated by Co-Lead Counsel, members of  
15 the Executive Committee and its Chair shall execute the orders of the Court concerning the  
16 conduct of the litigation; formulate and draft material for plaintiffs in the Consolidated Actions,  
17 including interrogatories, document requests, pleadings, briefs and motion papers; and perform  
18 such other tasks as are delegated by Co-Lead Counsel, including, for example, the taking of  
19 depositions upon oral examination. Co-Lead Counsel and the Executive Committee members  
20 may organize whatever subordinate bodies or subcommittees they deem expedient, such as  
21 discovery committees and briefing committees.

22 10. Co-Chair of the Executive Committee. The Co-Chairs of the Executive  
23 Committee shall be responsible for overseeing the work of that Committee, and coordinating the  
24 assignments established by the Co-Leads. At the Co-Leads invitation, the Co-Chairs may  
25 participate in the conferences and planning meetings conducted by Co-Leads.

26 11. Service of all papers filed with the Court shall be accomplished by e-filing, and  
27

no other type of service shall be required. Service of all papers that are not filed with the Court shall be accomplished by plaintiffs serving defendant's counsel, and by defendant serving Co-Lead Counsel for plaintiffs, as applicable, by either: (i) overnight mail service; (ii) telecopier or (iii) hand delivery. Whenever feasible, the serving party shall send courtesy copies simultaneously via e-mail in PDF format, to defendant's counsel or to Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs, as applicable.

### **III. APPLICATION OF THIS ORDER TO SUBSEQUENT CASES**

12. This Pretrial Order No. 1 shall apply to each related case subsequently added-on or transferred to this consolidated proceeding. When an action is added-on as part of these proceedings, plaintiffs' Liaison Counsel shall serve a file-endorsed copy of this Pretrial Order No. 1 to the attorneys for the plaintiff(s) in the add-on case, and direct that this Pretrial Order No. 1 be served upon any new defendant(s) in the add-on case, or their counsel. A new party objecting to the application of any provision of this Order must file a request for relief from this Order within ten (10) days of service of this Order upon that party.

### **IV. CONSOLIDATED AMENDED COMPLAINT**

13. A Consolidated Amended Complaint shall be filed and served on or before January 31, 2006. The Consolidated Amended Complaint shall supersede each of the six listed complaints, set forth in paragraph 1, above, and unless further amended, with leave of court, shall be the operative complaint in this proceeding. Defendant's responsive pleading shall be electronically filed on or before 4:00 pm on March 2, 2006. All prior dates, deadlines and hearings shall be vacated upon entry of this Order. If defendant decides to file anything other than an answer to the Consolidated Amended Complaint, then defendant shall inform plaintiff at least five Court days prior to filing such responsive pleading of the nature and basis of such motion, and the parties will meet and confer, and consult the Court, on a briefing schedule and hearing date thereon.

### **V. RULE 26 INITIAL DISCLOSURES**

14. The parties will meet and confer on or before February 16, 2006, per Federal Rule of Civil Procedure, Rule 26(f). The parties will exchange their Rule 26 Initial Disclosures fourteen days after the Rule 26(f) conference, on March 2, 2006. Discovery will commence in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

**VII. CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE**

15. A Case Management Conference will be held on March 3, 2006 at 10:30 a.m.

**VIII. MODIFICATION OF THIS ORDER**

16. This order may be modified or supplemented by the Court or on motion by any party for good cause shown.

I, Ira P. Rothken, hereby attest that I have on file all holograph signatures for any signatures indicated by a "conformed" signature (/s/) within this e-filed document.

Dated: January 18, 2006

IRA P. ROTHKEN  
ROTHKEN LAW FIRM

By: /s/ Ira P. Rothken  
Ira P. Rothken  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Dated: January 18, 2006

JONATHAN SHUB  
SHELLER, LUDWIG & BADEY, P.C.

By: /s/ Jonathan Shub  
Jonathan Shub  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Dated: January 18, 2006

RALPH STONE  
SHALOV STONE & BONNER, LLP

By: /s/ Ralph Stone  
Ralph Stone  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

1 Dated: January 18, 2006

STAN MALLISON  
THE LAW OFFICES OF MALLISON &  
MARTINEZ

2  
3  
4 By: /s/ Stan Mallison  
Stan Mallison  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

5  
6 Dated: January 18, 2006

MARK TAMBLYN  
KERSHAW CUTTER & RATINOFF LLP

7  
8 By: /s/ Mark Tamblyn  
Mark Tamblyn  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

9  
10 Dated: January 18, 2006

MICHAEL GOLDBERG  
MARC L. GODINO  
GLANCY, BINKOW & GOLDBERG

11  
12  
13 By: /s/ Marc L. Godino  
Marc L. Godino  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

14  
15 Dated: January 18, 2006

16 SETH LESSER  
THE LOCKS LAW FIRM

17  
18 By: /s/ Seth Lesser  
Seth Lesser  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

19  
20 Dated: January 18, 2006

21 PAUL WEISS  
FREED & WEISS LLP

22  
23 By: /s/ Paul Weiss  
Paul Weiss  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs



1 Dated: January 18, 2006

BRAD LAKIN  
THE LAKIN LAW FIRM

2  
3 By: /s/ Brad Lakin  
4 Brad Lakin  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

5 Dated: January 18, 2006

ROBERT GREEN  
GREEN WELLING LLP

6  
7  
8 By: /s/ Robert Green  
Robert Green  
9 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

10 Dated: January 18, 2006

RONEN SARRAF  
SARRAF GENTILE LLP

11  
12 By: /s/ Ronen Sarraf  
13 Ronen Sarraf  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

14 Dated: January 18, 2006

PENELOPE A. PREVOLOS  
LORI A. SCHECHTER  
ROGER E. COLLANTON  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

15  
16  
17  
18 By: /s/ Lori A. Schechter  
19 Lori A. Schechter  
Attorneys for Defendant  
20 PALM, INC.

21  
22  
23 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

24 Dated: January 25, 2006

/S/ RONALD M. WHYTE  
The Honorable Ronald M. Whyte  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE